

Content Analysis of Persian Literature Books of the First High School on the basis of Educational Connoisseurship and Criticism Components

Hayedeh Ashori¹, Maryam Seif Naraghi^{2*}, Ezatollah Naderi³, Majid Aliasgari⁴

1. PhD student of Curriculum Planning, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

2. Professor of Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

3. Professor of Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

4. Associate Professor of Kharazmi University

Article history:

Received date: 8 September 2017

Review date: 10 November 2017

Accepted date: 28 December 2017

Printed on line: 2 March 2018

Keywords:

Curriculum, Educational and Critical Sophistication Theory, Secondary School, Content Analysis of Persian Literature Books

Abstract

Purpose: The purpose of this study was to analyze the content of Persian literature books in the first grade of high school based on the components of educational and critical knowledge from the perspective of experts and teachers. **Methodology:** The method of this research is a type of evaluation study, which has been used to carry out the field research methodology. The statistical population includes curriculum specialists (118 people) and teachers of Persian literature in the first grade of high school in Mazandaran province (940 people). Stratified random sampling method was used to select 272 teachers and 92 curriculum specialists based on Cochran formula. A researcher-made questionnaire was developed using the nominal scale and Likert scale. The face and content validity of the questionnaire has been approved by the supervisors and counselors as well as a group of relevant curriculum specialists and relevant teachers who have sufficient expertise in the subject matter of the research. The reliability of the tool is confirmed by the Cronbach Alpha coefficient of 0.924. Descriptive statistics such as abundance and average percentages were used in the data analysis method and X2 test was used to test the assumptions. **Findings:** According to the findings of this research and based on the fact that the centralized educational system of Iran, where textbooks are considered to be the most basic educational resources available to teachers and students, in order to fulfill the curriculum objectives based on the components of critical and educational competence, the content of these textbooks was analyzed. **Discussion:** to formulate curriculum, which leads to the creation of interesting questions and the creation of Interested in reading new concepts based on documentation and away from any individual biases.

Please cite this article as: Ashori, H. Seif Naraghi, M. Naderi, E. Aliasgari, M. (2018). Content Analysis of Persian Literature Books of the First High School on the basis of Educational Connoisseurship and Criticism Components, *Iranian journal of educational Sociology*, 1(8), 67-85.

* Corresponding Author: mseifnaraghi@yahoo.com

1. Introduction

"Education or training" emphasizes the transfer, delivery, presentation and consolidation of values, beliefs, behaviors, attitudes, knowledge, skills, and so on in a wide variety of fields. These cases may vary according to local and regional requirements, according to cultural, social, economic and other conditions. However, "education or training" focuses on the strengthening, deployment, prominence, and manifestation of human attributes that are universal, harmonious with human nature and entity, and regardless of the preconditions for early development, social ... It is acceptable to all human beings and at all times and places. In fact, "upbringing" or "raising" is the main point and should be through "education" or "training" (Naderi & Seyf Naraghi, 1395: 4).

2. literature Review

Educational environments have an essential role to play in achieving such goals, and should be organized so that students are confronted with problems rather than storing scientific facts. Issues that are relevant to their actual lives, because life-based initiatives will make the educational situation more attractive and will increase the willingness and effort of students to learn more (Haeri, 1395: 31). The appearance of critical thinking in life with a particular view, according to the great thinker, Socrates, is associated with this way of thinking. When Socrates states that "untainted life does not have a value to live", he considers the need for critical thinking in all life to be the unique value of human life. This Thoughts Although the beginning of this method of thinking is in philosophy and in the field of education, the development of critical education is tied up as a relatively new theory with the names of educational thinkers like Freire, Giroux, McLaren, Apple and Kelner (Jacobs, 2011, quotes Taleb Zadeh & e.l, 1391: 178). The training of critical education, which according to the views of the philosophers and theorists of the Frankfurt School, especially Marcuse, emphasized the role of reason and awareness and emphasized the critique of cultural domination most of its emphasis (Fekri, 1389: 67).

"Educational Connoisseurship" and "Educational Criticism" are the words raised by Eisner. And is essentially based on the use of artistic perspectives in education. From the point of view of Eisner, teaching is an art; in the realm of fine arts, one is called a specialist who, in a particular artistic subject, can understand the features, issues and differences, and by doing so can understand what he sees and understands. , In the form of a layout and text that is understandable. What an educated person is doing in the field of education is generally personal, which is not understandable to others. The art of conveying what an expert knows about education is called "educational criticism." (Fathi & Arjagah, 1388: 227-229).

Regarding the components of structural consistency according to Ennis (1987), the use of these components in organizing curriculum concepts, including texts, assignments and images, leads to a logical and scientific content structure based on critical characteristics (Ennis, 1987, quotes Seyf, 1390: 553).

According to Eisner (1985), the organization of curriculum content has the feature of artwork, because compliance with the content compilation structure based on artwork is a meaningful, regular, calculated, and consequent research. The strength of the concepts depends on the observation of the components involved, the structural consistency leads to the coherence of the evidences, symbols and beliefs of the educational messages, and provides a uniform and coherent structure (Eisner, 1987, quoted by Taleb Zadeh Nobarian et al., 1391: 181).

One of the features of educational connoisseurship and criticism is the reference literacy of the concepts. According to Eisner's view (1987), the content of the curriculum can be traced back to the literary qualities, such as experiential phenomena and visible concepts, ability to Interpret, refer to and generalize. The components that Chamester and Johnson (2005) introduce, such as wise conscientiousness, stand-up, belief in others, the development of thought and curiosity, and so on, are components that are referenced with the characteristics mentioned (Eisenr, 1987, quoted by Taleb Zadeh Nobarian et al., 1391: 183).

In recent decades, it has been influenced by an approach to development of Cognitive Process, either the development of mental and intellectual processes, and connoisseurs and critical thinking in contemporary curriculum. The roots and historical background of this theory are related to one of the schools of psychology called phrenology. This school of psychology emerged in the nineteenth century and was developed under the influence of scholarly studies and researches such as Gall and Spurzhim. According to these studies, the human brain is the source of the talents and abilities of the individual, and develop rational activities and critique of creativity in education. Therefore, education and curricula should provide the ground for the growth, growth and prosperity of these brain and rational cells and, in fact, the well-known mental capacities and skills (Mahdipour, 1389: 43). Thinking is a practical skill that affects intelligence through experience. Thinking is ultimately human, the quality of the future depends entirely on the quality of thought, this point applies at the individual level, both at the community level and globally (Dulunu). Other definitions of thought can be heard from other thinkers such as John Dewey, Wertheimer, Rogue, Marzino and many others. But the value and importance of knowing the nature and process of thinking is that it can be fostered because the value and importance of developing thinking skills on the one hand among coaches due to the existence of diverse teaching and measurement materials and, on the other hand, the need to train skills patterns thinking in the era of technology has increased. The results of the development of thinking skills are to raise the level of perception, reasoning and deepening of understanding in relation to the subjects of education (Soleymanpour, 1392: 56).

Although knowledge is one of the dimensions of thought in humans, human beings will never have enough time to acquire all knowledge, especially in the era of knowledge explosion. In order to fill such a gap and prepare students, they need to be armed with their thinking skills, so that they can adapt themselves to the future and be ready for life to survive, so thinking like breathing is necessary for humans and without it significant life is not possible (Habibipour, 1392: 15). Referral adequacy means that the new insights generated through educational inquiries should be based on empirical phenomena that can be seen by others. This situation can be identified in terms of interpretation for referencing and generalization (Eisner, 1987, quoted by Taleb Zadeh Nobarian et al., 1391:181). The textbook is the most important manifestation of the curriculum through which the education takes the form of an executive. In this regard, this research intends to examine the content of Persian literature in the first grade of high school based on the components of critical and educational literacy in two processes of structural consistency and referential adequacy from the perspective of experts and teachers.

3. Methodology

Research is a type of evaluation study, in which the field research method has been used. The statistical population of the study includes all specialists of Persian language curriculum and teachers in the education of Mazandaran province in the first year of high school. The number of curriculum specialists based on Mazandaran province statistics, 118 and the number of teachers working in education in Mazandaran province are 940 is. The statistical sample includes curriculum specialists as well as teachers working in the Persian language lesson of the first high school of Mazandaran province. Given the fact that the research has two statistical societies, first by using the stratified sampling method, the sample size is determined by the same proportion as the size of each society. A sample of 90 curriculum subjects was selected through the Cochran formula. In the statistical society of Persian literature teachers of the first grade of high school, the sample size was selected using the Cochran formula of 272 people.

Specific tools and methods are required to obtain the necessary data for each of the variables in the research. In this research, in order to collect data in order to formulate the second chapter or the background of the research, as well as to design a suitable model for compiling Persian literature of the first grade high school based on the components of critical and educational knowledge, A: Using a library methodology such as books, articles, journals, websites and newspapers, national curriculum documents and other available documents, and reviewing printed and electronic resources based on snippets, on the subject of the research were used. B: Field method: A researcher-made questionnaire was used as the main tool for studying critical curriculum and curriculum components. According to the curriculum, critical and educational literacy (structural consistency and referential adequacy), the questionnaire was designed by a researcher with 29 items, of which 13 are related to structural consistency and 16 are referential qualities. The questionnaire was designed based on the theoretical foundations and guidance of the professors of the guidance in three sections (texts, pictures and assignments) and on the tripods (seventh, eighth and ninth). (The questionnaire is attached to the attachment). To answer each item, the nominal scale and in the Likert scale are five degrees: very high (5), high (4), moderate (3), low (2), and very low (1).

Table 1. Educational and critical literacy components (Ennis, 1987 quoted from Seif, 1390: 553). (Chamester & Johnson, 2005 quoted by Maleki, 1386: 108-93).

Components	Sub-components	Items
Structural Consistency	Searching	Search for a clear statement of the subject or question or messages
		Search for reasons in topic design
		Search different ways (paths) for existing issues
	Authenticity	Use and mention the authoritative resources
	Judgments	Judgment combined with rational reasoning from information obtained from observation
		Having a clear definition of the subject and arguments and avoiding the contradiction
		Inference argument related to the main subject
		Flexible and without bias
	Comprehensiveness	Considering the general situation in the design of each partial message
		Considering the main points in the entire text structure
		Not to forget the main issue of interest
		Effort to get comprehensive information on any topic

Referral Adequacy	Thinking Searching	Interesting question plan
		Need to know
		Satisfied with the new experiences
		Interested in reading new things
	Objectivism	Look at the documents
	The Breadth of Thought (open mind)	Pay attention to both sides of the case
		Pay attention to all aspects
		Fanatical support from a particular point of view
	Flexibility	Avoiding a serious and prejudiced matter
		Accepting compromise
		Examine different approaches for an issue
	Reasonable Skepticism	Avoid accepting clear things
		Questions and doubts in views that have little evidence
	Being Methodical	Avoid Unrelated Issues
		Organize the discussion logically
		Finding the result directly from the evidence
	Stand up	The person's standstill (searching for answers when others fail to find answers)
	Determination	Getting Conclusions
		Acting on the basis of evidence
		Continue work based on a decision
	Respecting other Views	Respect for the opinions of others
		Adopting other suggested topics and solutions
		Understand your vision with one of the possible perspectives

(A five-point Likert scale was used to evaluate the responses of participants in the study, with a low, very low, and high limit, considered very high and graded from 1 to 5, respectively).

4. Findings

After collecting statistical data, the researcher must analyze it so that it can determine its findings. Therefore, in this chapter, the data of the questionnaire were analyzed and descriptive and inferential statistics (X²) were used to test the research hypothesis.

First hypothesis: The distribution of the views of the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers varies in the Persian literature of the first grade secondary school based on the components of the critical and connoisseur curriculum (structural consistency and referential adequacy).

Table 2. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to the Questions of Structural Consistency of Texts in the Book of the seventh book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	176	63%	55	20%	46	17%	-	-
Experts	-	-	49	53%	24	21%	14	15%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 3.091$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.213 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 3.091$) is smaller than the χ table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views

of the two groups, the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers regarding Persian literature in the seventh grade, based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to the content of Table 2, more than 70% of specialists and teachers have chosen a low and moderate option. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the structural consistency of the Persian text of the seventh edition of the Persian language have evaluated it inappropriately and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 3. The Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Structural Consistency Questions in the eighth Book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	178	64%	64	23%	35	13%	-	-
Experts	-	-	51	55%	24	26%	17	18%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 2.797$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.247 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 2.797$) is smaller than the value of χ of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups, the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers regarding the Persian literature of the eighth grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to Table 4, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen a low and moderate option. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the structural consistency of the text of Persian literature in the eighth grade have been considered inappropriate, and therefore the current book does not require the super complete view.

Table 4. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Questions of Structural Consistency of texts in the ninth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	151	55%	81	29%	45	16%	-	-
Experts	-	-	45	49%	30	33%	17	18%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 0.873$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.646 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 0.873$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups, the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers, on the literature of Persian literature of the ninth grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to the content of Table 5, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen the low and medium option. Therefore, most of the research samples in

each group regarding the structural consistency of the text of the Persian literature of the ninth grade have been considered inappropriate, and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 5. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Referential Literacy Questions in the book of the seventh book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	179	65%	58	21%	40	17%	-	-
Experts	-	-	51	55%	23	25%	18	20%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 2.608$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.271 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 2.608$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups, the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers regarding Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to the content of Table 6, more than 80% of specialists and teachers have chosen a low and moderate option. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the text of the Persian text of the seventh grade have been considered inappropriate, and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 6. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Referential Literacy Questions in the eighth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	178	64%	60	22%	39	14%	-	-
Experts	-	-	52	56%	22	24%	18	20%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 2.797$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.247 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 2.797$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups, the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers regarding the Persian literature of the eighth grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to the content of Table 7, more than 80% of specialists and teachers have chosen a low and moderate option. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group in relation to the referential adequacy of the text of the Persian literature of the eighth grade, have evaluated it inappropriately, and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 7. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Referential Literacy Questions in the ninth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	6	2%	170	62%	70	25%	31	31%	-	-
Experts	2	2%	54	59%	19	21%	17	18%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 3.511$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.319 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 3.511$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the viewpoints of the two groups, the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers regarding the Persian literature of the ninth grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 8, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen very low, moderate, and medium choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the reference literacy adequacy of the ninth edition of the Persian literature have evaluated it inappropriately and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Second hypothesis: The distribution of viewpoints of curriculum experts and relevant teachers about the assignments of Persian literature is the first element of secondary education, based on the components of critical and connoisseur curriculum (structural consistency and referential adequacy).

Table 8. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to the Questions of Structural Consistency of Assignments in the seventh book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	169	61%	70	25%	31	14%	-	-
Experts	-	-	52	57%	18	19%	22	24%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 5.589$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.061 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 5.589$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the homework assignments of the Persian literature of the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to the content of Table 9, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen a low and moderate option. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the structural consistency of the Persian text of the seventh

edition of the Persian language have evaluated it inappropriately and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 9. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to the Questions of Structural Consistency of Assignments in the eighth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	136	49%	99	36%	42	15%	-	-
Experts	-	-	42	46%	26	28%	24	26%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 5.919$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.052 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 5.919$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the homework assignments of the Farsi 8th literature - based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to the contents of Table 10, more than 80% of specialists and teachers have chosen the low and medium option. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the structural consistency of the homework assignments of Persian literature in the eighth grade have been considered inappropriate and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 10. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to the Questions of Structural Consistency of Assignments in the ninth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	-	-	142	51%	89	32%	46	17%	-	-
Experts	-	-	45	49%	23	25%	24	26%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 4.504$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.105 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 4.504$) is smaller than the value of χ of the table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the viewpoints of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the homework assignments of Persian literature in the ninth grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to the content of Table 11, more than 70% of specialists and teachers have chosen a low and moderate option. Therefore, most research samples in each group regarding the structural consistency of the homework assignments of Persian literature of the ninth grade have evaluated it inappropriately and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 11. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Assignment Adequacy Questions in the seventh book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	14	5%	135	49%	107	38%	21	8%	-	-
Experts	2	2%	39	42%	37	41%	14	15%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 6.201$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.102 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 6.201$) is smaller than the value of table χ ; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the assignments of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 12, more than 85% of experts and teachers have chosen very low, low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the assignments of Persian literature in the seventh grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 12. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Assignment Adequacy Questions in the eighth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	14	5%	135	49%	107	38%	21	8%	-	-
Experts	2	2%	39	42%	37	40%	14	15%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 7.585$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.055 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 7.585$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the assignments of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 13, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the assignments of Persian literature in the eighth grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 13. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Assignment Adequacy Questions in the ninth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	16	6%	125	45%	102	37%	34	12%	-	-
Experts	4	4%	39	42%	31	34%	18	20%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 3.169$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.366 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 3.169$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the assignments of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 14, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen very low, low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the assignments of Persian literature in the ninth grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Third hypothesis: The distribution of viewpoints of curriculum experts and relevant teachers about the images of Persian literature is the first element of secondary education, based on the components of critical and connoisseur curriculum (structural consistency and referential adequacy).

Table 14. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Questions on Structural consistency of images in the seventh book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	10	4%	151	55%	87	31%	29	10%	-	-
Experts	2	2%	47	51%	26	28%	17	19%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 4.366$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.225 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 4.366$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to Table 15, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 15. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Questions on Structural consistency of images in the eighth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	24	9%	130	47%	88	32%	35	13%	-	-
Experts	6	7%	38	41%	28	30%	20	22%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 4.749$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.191 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 4.749$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to Table 16, more than 75% of experts and teachers have chosen low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the images of Persian literature in the eighth grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 16. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Questions on Structural consistency of images in the ninth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	6	2%	132	48%	112	40%	27	10%	-	-
Experts	2	2%	41	45%	34	37%	15	16%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 2.960$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.398 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 2.960$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, according to Table 17, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the images of Persian literature in the ninth grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 17. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Images Adequacy Questions in the seventh book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	47	17%	107	39%	103	37%	20	7%	-	-
Experts	12	13%	31	34%	37	40%	12	13%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 3.982$ DF = 3 The probability of error = 0.263 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 3.982$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 18, more than 85% of experts and teachers have chosen very low, low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 18. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Images Adequacy Questions in the eighth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	29	11%	137	50%	88	32%	23	8%	-	-
Experts	9	10%	41	45%	27	29%	15	19%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 4.798$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.187 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 4.798$) is smaller than the value of X of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 19, more than 80% of experts and teachers have chosen low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the images of Persian literature in the eighth grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

Table 19. Frequency and Percent of Frequency of Responses Given to Images Adequacy Questions in the ninth book

Statistical Measures Groups	Very Low		Low		Moderate		High		Very High	
	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.	Freq.	Per.
Teachers	17	6%	119	43%	113	41%	28	10%	-	-
Experts	3	3%	36	39%	41	45%	12	13%	-	-

The Statistic value of the $\chi = 2.080$ DF = 2 The probability of error = 0.556 ($p < 0.05$)

Considering that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 ($\chi = 2.080$) is smaller than the value of χ of table; Therefore, the null hypothesis is confirmed, and the hypothesis of the research is that the difference between the two distributions is rejected with a probability of 95% confidence; It follows that there is no statistically significant difference between the distribution of the views of the two groups - the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers on the images of Persian literature in the seventh grade based on the components of the curriculum of educational and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to Table 20, more than 85% of experts and teachers have chosen very low, low, and moderate choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in each group regarding the adequacy of the images of Persian literature in the ninth grade have inappropriately evaluated it and thus the current book does not have the necessary perfection from the above perspective.

5. Discussion

The purpose of this study is to analyze the content of Persian literature in the first grade of high school based on the components of educational and critical knowledge from the perspective of experts and teachers. This research is considered to be an applied research, which is done by the field research method. In the first step, the theoretical foundations and the background of research related to the topic of research both in and outside the country have been studied and carefully reviewed. The structural consistency is related to the coherence of the evidence and arguments provided by the critic. And they answer the following questions: are the criticized statements and beliefs supported by evidence? Does it lead to a convincing (objective, unitary) image? Are the educational concepts and evidence to be effectively matched to formulate pseudo-ideals (a comprehensive set of information)?

Considering the results obtained from the structural consistency component, since the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality of 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 is smaller than the value of χ of the table. Therefore, the zero assumption is rejected, and the assumption of the research is that the two distributions are identical with a probability of 95% confidence, It follows that the distribution of the views of the curriculum specialists and relevant teachers regarding the literature of the Persian literature of the first grade is secondary to the components of the critical curriculum (structural consistency) in terms of statistics. In other words, according to the content of tables 2, 3 and 4, it can be stated that about 70% of teachers and specialists have chosen the low and medium option. Therefore, most research samples in both groups regarding the structural consistency of Persian literature in the first grade of secondary school have been considered inappropriate and therefore the current book does not require super complete view. The results of referential adequacy show that the calculated value of χ in the level of fatality is 5% and with the degree of freedom 2 and 3, is smaller than the value of χ of the table. Therefore, the zero assumption is rejected

and the assumption of the research is that the two distributions are similar with a probability of 95% confidence, it follows that the distribution of the views of the curriculum specialists and the relevant teachers regarding the literature of Persian literature of the first grade is secondary, based on the components of the critical curriculum (referential adequacy), is similar. In other words, according to the contents of Tables 5, 6 and 7, it can be stated that about 80% of teachers and specialists have chosen a low and very low option. Therefore, most of the research samples in both groups regarding the literacy adequacy of Persian literature in the first grade of secondary school have been considered unfavorable, this book does not have the desirability of referring to the adequacy of the texts.

The explanation of the result is that the major part of the success of each work is due to the transparency, simplicity and health of the text that has been chosen to convey its concepts. The text of an efficient and effective book should persuade the reader to study and, with the fewest possible vocabulary, give him the most awareness, rather than overwhelming the audience with unnecessary complexities, and plunging his mind into ambiguity and confusion. According to Eisner (1994), inspired by the concept of "credibility" in qualitative research, the three criteria of social validity, structural strength, and referential adequacy as criteria for determining the credibility of a study by a method of educational critique. Eisner (1994), referring to the concept of objectivity in quantitative research as a criterion for determining the accuracy of the report's findings, identifies objectivity in the context of qualitative research as the function of the mental agreement between a specialist in a particular field and the process of achieving this agreement with The concept of social credit is described.

The concept of referential adequacy also suggests that the concepts reported in critique are understandable to readers, since the major function of educational criticism, like any other critique, is to increase the perception and understanding of the educational community about the content of the curriculum. The reference criterion is obtained when another person (teacher) can understand the presence of the signs or features reported in the critique in the real event or situation. In addition, the report of criticism should give the perception and insights to the person who cannot be reached without evaluation. As in the indexes and components studied, the content of the course is determined by theoretical research model.

The fundamental distinction between the two concepts of structural consistency and referential adequacy is that structural consistency is an internal criterion, and its focus is on the degree of cohesion, integrity, and persuasiveness of the concepts presented in the critique. While referential adequacy is external, its focus is on matching, informing, and revealing the qualitative and complex qualities associated with the phenomenon of peer evaluation in similar situations (Talebzadeh, Nubriyan and Fathi Vajargah, 1391: 182- 189). What is important is to combine this framework into a problem-solving approach.

Based on the above, the following objectives clarify and extend critical thinking strategies in educational content. These objectives are: 1. To find positive opinions about the evaluation of their opinions by others and to the opinions of others, and as a result, the motivation for communication and dialogue as a ground for critical thinking is provided. 2. To justify the reasons for an opinion, the sense of responsibility, and the correct and logical thinking that can be used to identify the assumptions of each issue and the results it emanates from. 3. Emphasize the rational growth of the future conflicts of pluralism. 4. Collecting and organizing information from multiple sources and selection, research and information descriptions. 5. Identify and express the problem and organize the information about the topic and consider different ways

to solve the problem. 6. Transfer and generalize and extract the rules and principles that apply to solve the problem.

The results of referential adequacy show that the calculated χ value is less than the value of χ in the risk level of 5% and with the degree of freedom 3. Therefore, the zero assumption is rejected and the assumption of the research is that the two distributions are similar with a probability of 95% confidence. It follows that the distribution of the curriculum specialists and relevant teachers regarding the assignments of Persian literature in the first grade of secondary school is similar according to the components of the critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to the content of tables 8, 9 and 10, it can be stated that about 85% of teachers and specialists have chosen the low and very low and medium choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in both groups regarding the adequacy of the homework assignments of Persian literature in the first grade of secondary school have been evaluated as undesirable. Therefore, it can be stated that the book does not have the required perfection in terms of the adequacy of referrals.

The explanation of the results is that the design and provision of appropriate assignments helps students to reduce their mistakes and increase their success on the learning journey. Accordingly, the concept of homework expands, and it can no longer be recapitulated and rewritten. In fact, the design of assignments is the design of a learning opportunity for students with special educational needs, and this need is known by studying the past performance of the individual and analyzing its errors and successes (Hosseini, 1384: 83). Hence, the most effective type of assignments are assignments in which the learner is asked to directly use the new learning in a personalized way. Homework should be related to what you are teaching. Assignments should be inclusive to think and design. Describe the assignment well and explain the purpose of doing it clearly.

Taking into account the meta-cognitive skills of Flavel (1976), metacognition is defined as active control and the setting of cognitive activities for achieving cognitive goals (quoted by Marzuqi, 1383). Williams et al. (2002), teach metacognitive knowledge to students to develop a strategic learning and promotion of their classroom performance. Lifford, Eckbad, and Zeimian(2000) emphasize that metacognitive awareness training enables learners to assess their previous knowledge. Monitor your comprehension and refine your reading comprehension when reading. Some argue that metacognitive strategies explain 70% of students' academic performance (Araban, 1380).

Considering the results obtained from the component of structural consistency, since the calculated value of χ is less than the value of χ of the table at a 5% fatal degree and with a degree of freedom 3. Therefore, the zero assumption is rejected and the assumption of the research is that the two distributions are similar with a probability of 95% confidence, it follows that the statistical distribution of the views of curriculum specialists and relevant teachers regarding the images of Persian literature of the first grade secondary school is similar to the components of the critical curriculum (structural consistency). In other words, considering the contents of Tables 12, 13 and 14, it can be stated that more than 80% of teachers and specialists have chosen the low and medium option. Therefore, most of the research samples in both groups regarding the structural consistency of Persian language homework assignments in the first grade have been considered unfavorable, and therefore the book does not deserve to do so.

The results of referential adequacy show that the calculated χ value is less than the value of χ in the risk level of 5% and with the degree of freedom 3. Therefore, the zero assumption is rejected and the

assumption of the research is that the two distributions are similar with a probability of 95% confidence, It follows that the distribution of the views of curriculum specialists and relevant teachers regarding the images of Persian literature in the first grade secondary school is comparable in terms of the critical and critical curriculum (referential adequacy). In other words, according to the content of tables 15, 16, and 17, it can be stated that about 85% of teachers and specialists have chosen very low, moderate, and medium choices. Therefore, most of the research samples in both groups have been evaluated as undesirable in relation to the adequacy of Persian literature in the first grade of high school. It can be argued that the images of the Persian literature of the first-grade secondary school are not suitable for referential adequacy.

In the explanation of the result in the analysis of the images of the book of Persian literature, it is possible to criticize the art of this view. Eisner (1994) expresses his concern with the artistic fundamentals of knowledge education that artistic and imaginative research is rarely used as an alternative approach or method for interpreting and evaluating educational activities. He believes that the re-familiarity and insufficient recognitions of educators and educators to various forms of research and, at the same time, absolute rule and the perception of quantitative methods, and in particular experimental methods, as the most authoritative educational methods, tendency to the artistic study of phenomena and educational issues; However, using artistic methods such as educational criticism can identify and reveal many subtle, yet valuable educational qualities.

The concepts associated with both "sophistication" and "critique" refer to evaluator or curriculum researcher's ability to understand and disclose subtle, subtle and ambiguous qualities of educational phenomena. Experiences from Eisner's perspective refer to the art of perceiving qualities, and critique expresses the disclosure or revealing of perceived features or aspects of knowledge through (Eisner, 1991, 1994). Sophistication requires the ability to sense and understand phenomena, to clean and distinguish delicacies, and to understand the experiences. The criticism requires publicizing the experience through various forms of representation. The images are metaphorical and symbolic; which Eisner calls the "creative" language. This type of language and expression describes the emotional and semantic qualities inherent in the experience of conveying a message to the image and message through images in a creative way in the artistic dimension of the curriculum.

Given the fact that the present study is conducted in the area of curriculum planning, based on the results and findings of the research, suggestions are presented to apply these results in educational settings: 1- Based on the results of Table 2, 3 and 4 in Chapter 4, it is suggested to the specialists and authors of the textbooks of Persian literature of the first grade secondary school, to formulate the text of the text without any ambiguity and clearly and clearly. So students do not get confused. 2- According to the results of tables 2, 3 and 4 in Chapter 4, it is suggested that the textbooks of the literature of the first cycle of high school combined with rational precision and reasoning be set apart from any personal bias, and flexible. 3- With reference to the results of Table 2, 3 and 4 in Chapter 4, it is suggested that comprehensive information on any subject or concepts be used from multiple and reliable sources and not referring to a single source, to avoid prejudices and objectivity of avoidance concepts. 4- According to the results of Table 5, 6 and 7 in Chapter 4, it is suggested to the specialists and authors of the Persian textbooks of the first grade secondary school, the textbooks with interesting and challenging questions, by providing new experiences to the students in need of knowing New materials are designed to make students interested in reading and learning new concepts. 5- Considering the results of Table 5, 6 and 7 in Chapter 4, it is suggested that the

generalizability of concepts and topics be considered in several aspects, and that one-sidedness be avoided.

6- Based on the results of Table 4, 5 and 6 in Chapter 4, in compiling Persian textbooks of Persian literature, the first grade high school has taken into account the views and views of the consensus and the opposition, in order to encourage students to accept the results based on the presentation of various suggestions.

7- According to the results of tables 8, 9 and 10 in Chapter 4, it is recommended to specialists and authors of Persian textbooks of Persian language, first grade secondary school, homework without any ambiguity, dynamic and creative, along with other programs that Designed to educate students to increase their ability to confront a changing world.

8- According to the results of tables 8, 9 and 10 in Chapter 4, it is suggested to focus on challenging homework with terms such as: who, how, when, where, when to start, to stimulate curiosity Learners on the subject of the curriculum, consolidating the level of learning, fostering imagination and creativity, and driving critical thinking.

9- Based on the results of Table 8, 9 and 10 in Chapter 4, since deep and sustainable learning is done through various solutions, it is recommended to the specialists and authors of the Persian literature books of the first grade secondary school. Teaching assignments are as follows It is designed to guide students to identify different solutions.

10- According to the results of Table 11, 12 and 13 in Chapter 4, it is suggested that the subjects of the Persian textbooks of the first-level high school are based on facts, in order to organize the logic of class discussions, in order to search the results related to the main subject of the lesson, to learn Couple with pleasure, practice, and more focus on mastering curriculum concepts.

11- According to the results of Table 14, 15 and 16 in Chapter 4, it is suggested to the experts and authors of the Persian textbooks of the first grade secondary school, since the images motivate the students to read and increase the speed of reading, it is clear and Clear and far from any ambiguity in a way that is consistent with the concepts of the book and does not create contradictions.

12- Based on the results of Table 17, 18 and 19 in Chapter 4, it is suggested that in the presentation of lesson images of unilateralism, the concepts and the lessons learned are avoided, the evaluations of the curriculum are far from personal and realistic, and the results of the discussion related to the subject's main subject matter is directly derived from the evidence in the images.

13- Based on the results of Table 17, 18 and 19 in Chapter 4, it is recommended to the specialists and authors of the Persian textbooks of the first cycle of secondary education, in such a way as to formulate curriculum, which leads to the creation of interesting questions and the creation of Interested in reading new concepts based on documentation and away from any individual biases.

References

- Eisner, E. W. (1976). Educational connoisseurship and criticism: Their form and function in educational evaluation. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 10, 135-150.
- Eisner, E. W. (1991). *The enlightened eye: Qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice*. Macmillan Publishing Company: New York and Toronto.
- Eisner, E. W. (1994). *The educational imagination: On the design and evaluation of school Programs*. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Eisner, E. W. (2004). What can education learn from the arts about the practice of education? *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 5(4), 1-12.
- Fathi Vajargah, Kourosh. (1388). *Principles and Concepts of Curriculum Planning*, Tehran: Ball Publishing University.
- Fekri, Farahnaz (1389), *The Relationship between Thinking Styles and Critical Thinking of the Experts of the Education* Department of Tehran, Master's Thesis, Unpublished, Faculty of Social Sciences, Islamic Azad University, Tehran Branch.
- Ghassemifar, Nosratallah. (1393). *Thinking Mechanism*, Tehran: Ghesidehsra Publishing.
- HabibiPour, Majid (1392), *Critical Thinking Creator Classroom*, Teacher's Growth Magazine, No. 4.
- Hayrizadeh, Beyhm's Charity (1395), *Creative Thinking and Creative Problem Solving*, Tehran: Publishing Ney.
- Jonathan, H. (2006). "Connoisseurship, assessments of performance and questions of reliability", annual IAEA conference, Singapore.
- Lipman, M. (2001), *thinking in education*. Cambridge, England. Cambridge University Press.
- Mahdipour, Maryam (1389), *The Effectiveness of Critical Thinking and Meta-Cognitive Strategies on the Creativity and Academic Achievement of Secondary School Students in Amol City*, Master's Thesis, Undergraduate, Psychology, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon Branch.
- Maleki, Hasan and Habibipour, Majid (1386), *Development of Critical Thinking. The Basic Purpose of Education*, Educational Innovations Quarterly, No. 19, pp. 103-93.
- Marsh, Colin J. (2009). *Key Concepts for Understanding Curriculum*. London: Taylor & Francis Routledge.
- Marzouki, Rahmatolah (1385), *The Foundations and Framework of an ICT-based Creative Curriculum*, Six.
- McNiff, S. (2008). Art based research. In J.G Knowles & A.L Cole (Eds), *Handbook of the Arts in Qualitative Research* (pp 29-40). SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Naderi, Ezatollah and Seifnragi, Maryam (1395), *Research Methods and Evaluation in Humanities*, Tehran, Badr Publishing.
- Sedaghat Hamedani, Marjan (1389), *Study of the content of Farsi language books in high school and high school students' point of view*, Master's dissertation, Payame Noor University of Tehran.
- Seif, Aliakbar (1390), *Educational Psychology (Psychology of Learning and Education)*, 11th Edition, Tehran: Agah Publishing.
- Shariatmadari, Ali (1393), *educational and educational missions of educational centers*, Eighth, Tehran: Samt Publishing.
- Soleymanpour, Javad (1392), *New Teaching Skills*, Fourth, Tehran: Ahsan Publication.
- Talebzadeh Nobarian, Mohsen; Fathi Vajargah, Kourosh. (1391), *Specialty Planning Curriculum*, Tehran: Publishing Ayij.